

TO INVESTIGATE INTO THE INCIDENT IN WHICH
CESSNA F 337 H. REGISTRATION NO. AP - BBT WAS
LOST AFTER TAKE OFF FROM MULTAN FOR ISLAMABAD
AIRPORT ON 8TH OCTOBER, 1985

1. AIRCRAFT INFORMATION

- 1.1 Aircraft type and manufacturers S.No. : Cessna F337H
- 1.2 Registration Marking : AP-BBT
- 1.3 Engine type, installation and manufacturers S.No. : Continentle teledyne
10-360 G.
R-352769-date-1978
F-50R465-date-1978
- 1.4 Certificate of Registration: 568 Valid.
- 1.5 Certificate of Airworthiness: 521(Rev-I) Valid upto
24-6-1986.
- 1.6 Certificate of Maintenance : Valid.
- 1.7. Date of construction of Airframe : 1978
- 1.8 Owner : Falcon Aviation Services Limited.
- 1.9. Weight permitted by C of A : 4630 Lbs.
- 1.10 Weight at time of accident : N/A
- 1.11 C of G : 140.5" aft of datumpoint.
D.P. is at fuselage station
0.0. and is at 65" forward
of F. Wall.
- 1.12 AIRFRAME HISTORY
- 1.12.1 Hours since new : 1528.57 Hours
- 1.12.2 Hours since C of A inspection : 248.35 Hours
- 1.12.3 Modifications : Upto Date.
- 1.13 ENGINE HISTORY
- 1.13.1 Hours since new : Front-1528.57, Rear 1404.20
- 1.13.2 Hours since C of A inspection : Front-248.35, Rear 97.50
- 1.13.3 Modification : Upto Date
- 1.14 Accessory : VHF-Two, VOR Two, ADF One,
Auto pilot.
- 1.15 Defects : Nil

2. CREW INFORMATION

2.1 Chief Pilot

2.1.1 Name : Anwaar Ellahi Chishty

2.1.2 Date of birth : 26-02-1959

2.1.3 Where Trained : MONCTON Flying Club, Canada

2.1.4 Type of Licence and Number : Commercial 936
PA-28-140, PA-28-151, PA-28-161

2.1.5 Aircraft type ratings : CESSNA-150/152, CESSNA-337/L
PA-38-112, PA-28 R200

2.1.6 Aircraft type rating current : CESSNA 150/152, CESSNA-337/L

2.1.7 Medical date with status : Valid till 04-02-1986
Fit for commercial

2.1.8 Total in Command : 309 hrs. 50 Min.

2.1.9 Total flying experience : Appx. 440 hrs.

2.1.10 Total in command on the type incident occurred : Appx. 114 "

2.1.11 Date of Joining Governor's Fleet : N/A

2.2 Co-Pilot

2.2.1 Name : Tariq Mahmood

2.2.2 Date of birth : 07-8-1957

2.2.3 Where trained : Rawalpindi Flying Club

2.2.4 Type of Licence and No. : C.P.L. No.1080

2.2.5 Aircraft type ratings : CESSNA 152 II/180E/337/L

2.2.6 Aircraft type rating current : CESSNA 152 II/180E & 337/L

2.2.7 Medical date with status : Valid till 21-3-1986
Fit for commercial

2.2.8 Total flying experience : Appx. 1400 hrs.

2.2.9 Total in command : " 1340 "

2.2.10 Total in command on the type incident occurred : 400 "

2.2.11 Date of joining Governor's Fleet : N/A

3. SUMMARY

- 3.1 A Cessna F337H, Registration No. AP-BBT belonging to Falcon Aviation Services Limited was on a chartered flight on 8th October, 1985 from Multan to Islamabad Airport. The Captain of the aircraft was Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A") and Safety Pilot Mr. Tariq Mehmood (Appendix "B").
- 3.2 The route of the aircraft was OPMT-VATNI-S.P-INDEX-OPRN. The aircraft took off from Multan at 1655 L.T. on way to Vatni.
- 3.3 Flight plan was not filed by the Captain of the aircraft as laid down in AIP (RAC 1-1, para-2, sub para 3.3.1.1.2.2.) but instead was done on R/T and accepted by Multan Air Traffic Control.
- 3.4 According to the statement of Duty Controller Mr. Iftikhar Ahmed Butt (Appendix "E") and ATC Operator Mr. Saleem Ahmed (Appendix "G"), Captain Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "B") and Safety Pilot Mr. Tariq Mehmood (Appendix "B") were briefed on weather including Multan weather warning by Duty Controller Mr. Iftikhar Ahmed Butt (Appendix "E"). However both the pilots have denied that they were provided with Multan weather warning.
- 3.5 When the aircraft was abeam shorkot the weather started building up at Vatni and the Captain requested Multan for flight level 95 to avoid the clouds (Appendix "A"). Later on Captain Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty decided to divert to Lahore due weather; and was lost before reaching Raiwind Railway Station and ultimately started circling the said Railway Station at flight level of 1000 feet AGL without knowing his ground position. He declared himself lost. Lahore ATC was informed accordingly (Appendix "A" & "B"). The Captain of the aircraft asked for Radar assistance, which could not be provided unless the aircraft gained height which was not possible due to extreme bad weather.
- 3.6 The aircraft could not be vectored to Lahore Airport because of the unserviceability of VDF

/and

and also due to the fact that ground position was not known. ?

3.7 Station Master Raiwind Railway Station informed the control room at Lahore Railway Station that a small aircraft was flying very low over the Railway Station and was most probably lost. The control room at Lahore Railway Station conveyed this information to Airport Manager Lahore, who in turn conveyed to all concerned. After ensuring once again the aircraft was over Raiwind Railway Station. Cessna F337H was vectored to Lahore Airport and landed at 1911 L.T.

3.8 On receipt of the above information Wg. Cdr. (Retd), Nazir A. Siddiqi, Manager Flight Safety (North) was detailed as Investigator Incharge by Director General Civil Aviation Authority, who was at Islamabad Airport, to proceed immediately to Lahore and Multan to investigate this incident. The Investigator Incharge left at 1200 hours and reached Lahore at 1400 hours on 10th October, 1985 and commenced the investigation.

3.9 There were no injuries to the occupants and everyone was safe.

vague
3.10 The aircraft apparently sustained no visual damage.

4. INJURY TO PERSONS

4.1 No injuries were sustained by the occupants.

5. DAMAGE TO AIRCRAFT

5.1 The aircraft apparently sustained no visual damage.

6. OTHER DAMAGES

6.1 No other damage reported.

7. METEOROLOGICAL CONDITIONS

7.1 Weather was fair while departing from Multan.

7.2 Weather was a factor.

8. AIDS TO NAVIGATION

8.1 Aids to Navigation were operating normal.

8.2 Aids to Navigation were not a factor.

*wrong statement.
See para 3.6 - VDF
was installed at Lahore
just to avoid such
situations*

/Communication

9. COMMUNICATION

9.1 The aircraft was in contact on VHF R/T even after landing in the field.

not understood

9.2 Communication was not a factor.

10. AERODROME AND GROUND FACILITIES

10.1 Normal facilities were available at the airport, but VDF was U/S at Lahore.

10.2 Aerodrome and ground facilities was not a factor.

11. FLIGHT RECORDERS

11.1 Not fitted nor required to be fitted.

12. WRECKAGE

12.1 The aircraft apparently sustained no visual damage and landed safely at Lahore Airport.

13. FIRE

13.1 No fire occurred.

14. SURVIVAL ASPECT

14.1 There were no injuries to the occupants and everyone was safe.

15. TEST AND RESEARCH

15.1 Not required.

16. OBSERVATIONS

16.1 Flight plan was not filed by the Captain of the aircraft as laid down in AIP (RAC 1-1, para-2, sub para 3.3.1.1.2.2.) but instead was done on R/T and accepted by Multan Air Traffic Control.

16.2 The Captain of aircraft should have diverted back to Multan immediately on seeing weather development. The Captain failed to do so on the plea that there was a weather warning of Multan, without realising that all such weather warnings are a forecast only, and there was no harm in checking up the latest weather situation at Multan on R/T.

16.3 Gross carelessness was displayed by the Captain of aircraft and Safety Pilot thus jeopardizing the safety of aircraft and its occupants.

*what about
Lahore wx
at the time of
diversion decision*

unsubstantiated

I N V E S T I G A T I O N

17. SCENE OF ACCIDENT

- 17.1. The investigator incharge arrived at Lahore Airport at 1400 hours on 10th October, 1985.
- 17.2. On arrival at Lahore Airport initial discussions were held with Airport Manager Lahore Airport, SATO Lahore Airport, Duty Controller Lahore Airport, Captain Anwaar Ellahi Chishty and Safety Pilot Mr. Tariq Mehmood.
- 17.3. The investigator incharge left for Multan on 12th October, 1985 in connection with the investigation and held initial discussions with Airport Manager Multan Airport, SATO Multan Airport and Duty Controller Multan Airport.
- 17.4. There were no flight plan proformas available in ATC and these proformas could not be photo copied due to non availability of photo stat papers.
- 17.5. There appears to be no positive control of Airport Manager Multan, Mr. Mubarik Ali on ATC matters, as most of the time Airport Manager Mr. Mubarik Ali was not in place of duty and was busy with personal matters.

18. EXAMINATION OF THE WRECKAGE

- 18.1. Not applicable.

19. WITNESSES

- 19.1. The following information was obtained from the witnesses:-
 - 19.1.1. Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A") Captain of Cessna F337H stated that he took off from Multan for Islamabad Airport on 8th October, 1985.
 - 19.1.2. Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A") Captain stated that the route of the aircraft was OPMT-VATNI-S.P-INDEX-OPRN.
 - 19.1.3. Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A") Captain of aircraft stated that he filed a flight plan on R/T and not on a flight

/plan

plan proforma as laid down in AIP (RAC 1-1, para-2, sub para 3.3.1.1.2.2.), as the said proformas were not available in ATC. He further stated that he was fully briefed on all aspects of the flight including weather. He however was not briefed about Multan weather warning.

19.1.4. According to the statement of Duty Controller Mr. Iftikhar Ahmed Butt (Appendix "E") and ATC Operator Mr. Saleem Ahmed (Appendix "G"), Captain Anwaar Ellahi Chishti (Appendix "A") and Safety Pilot Mr. Tariq Mehmood (Appendix "B") were briefed on weather including Multan weather warning by Duty Controller Mr. Iftikhar Ahmed Butt (Appendix "E"). However both the pilots have denied that they were provided with Multan weather warning.

19.1.5. Captain Anwaar Ellahi Chishti (Appendix "A") stated that when he was abeam shorkot the weather started building up at Vatni and he requested Multan for flight level 95 to avoid the clouds (Appendix "A"). He further stated that he decided to divert to Lahore due weather, and was lost before reaching Raiwind Railway station and ultimately started circling the said Railway station at flight level 1000 AGL, without knowing his ground position. He declared himself lost and Lahore ATC was informed accordingly. This is supported by the statement of Safety Pilot Mr. Tariq Mehmood (Appendix "B").

19.1.6. Mr. Kirni Qamar, Duty Controller Lahore Airport stated that the aircraft could not be vectored to Lahore airport because of the unserviceability of VDF. He further stated that VDF has been unserviceable on a number of occasions during the month of August and September 1985 and the matter has been reported to the Electronic Engineer responsible for the maintenance of this equipment. The details of the unserviceability of VDF is given in the statement of Mr. Kirni Qamar (Appendix "C").

/According

19.1.7. According to the statement of Mr. Ejaz Hussain Assistant Electronic Engineer of Lahore Airport (Appendix "D") the VDF equipment had been frequently unserviceable. When checked in workshop no defect was established and VDF became S/A on its own. He further stated that the VDF equipment installed was model no. 7010-11R S.No. 1003. While the maintenance manual no. G-14-1517, G-14-1518, G-14-1519 for VHF Doppler Director Finder System model 7010-11LC. He further pointed out that no person of his section had been trained on this equipment and further more no technical help was sought from EED Karachi as the equipment used to become stable after cleaning and checking of the tuning etc.

19.1.8. According to the statement of Mr. Iftikhar Ahmed Butt (Appendix "E") Duty ATCO, Captain Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A") of Cessna F 337 H and Safety Pilot Mr. Tariq Mehmood (Appendix "B") were briefed on all aspects before their departure. He further stated as the flight plan proforma was not available because of the non availability of the photo stat papers. They were advised to give FPL on R/T for tape and record. This was on 8th October, 1985. Mr. Iftikhar Ahmed Butt (Appendix "E") stated that the Captain Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A") and Safety Pilot Mr. Tariq Mehmood (Appendix "B") were briefed on weather, including Multan weather warning report, which indicated dust raising/thunder storm likely to occur over Multan Airport and 25 miles around Multan during the period 081100Z to 081400Z. The aircraft departed 1154Z. He stated that at 1220Z AP-BBT requested to climb to flight level 95 due weather. He was cleared accordingly. This was done after coordination with Lahore FIO. Mr. Iftikhar Ahmed Butt (Appendix "E") stated that on 8th Oct. 1985 PK-651 briefed enroute weather to AP-BBT and asked Captain Anwaar Ellahi Chishty of Cessna F 337 H of AP-BBT whether he had weather Radar on board. AP-BBT confirmed that weather Radar

/was

was on board. Further more PK-651 cautioned AP-BBT that they would face weather enroute. He stated that at 1406Z Lahore FIO informed that AP-BBT had lost his ground position but was in contact with Lahore FIC. He stated that 1411Z Lahore FIO informed that AP-BBT had landed safely at Lahore Airport (Appendix "E").

19.1.9. Mr. Saleem Ahmed, ATC Operator (Appendix "G") Multan Airport stated that he was on duty on 8th October, 1985 from 0900Z to 1500Z. At 1050Z Captain Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A") came to Multan ATC for flight planning and weather warning. Mr. Saleem Ahmed stated that in his presence both the Captains were briefed on weather including Multan weather warning by Duty Controller Mr. Iftikhar Ahmed Butt (Appendix "E").

19.1.10. Mr. Aslam Qureshi, ATCO Multan Airport (Appendix "F") stated that he was on morning duty and was performing additional duty as SATO. He stated that he was informed by Mr. Iftikhar Ahmed Butt (Appendix "E") ATCO, that Cessna F 337 H AP-BBT has lost his ground position and was in contact with Lahore. He further stated that later on he was informed that Cessna F 337 H had landed safely at Lahore Airport at 1411Z.

20. DOCUMENTS

20.1 The following information was obtained from the documents.

- 20.1.1. The aircraft was properly registered bearing Nationality and Registration Mark AP-BBT.
- 20.1.2. Aircraft was properly maintained having C of A, C of M and D.I.
- 20.1.3. Flight was properly authorised.
- 20.1.4. C.P.L. No. 936 was valid.
- 20.1.5. C.P.L. No. 1080 was valid.

/Discussion

21. DISCUSSION

21.1. ANALYSIS

- 21.1.1. Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A")
/ on an was/authorized chartered flight on 8th Oct. 1985 in Cessna F 337 H, Registration No. AP-BBT.
- 21.1.2. Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A")
Captain of aircraft stated that he took off from Multan for Islamabad Airport on 8th October, 1985 and that the route of the aircraft was OPMT-VATNI-S.P-INDEX-OPRN.
- 21.1.3. Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A")
Captain of Cessna F 337 H stated that he filed a flight plan on R/T as the flight plan proformas were not available in ATC. He further stated that he was not briefed about Multan weather warning.
- 21.1.4. Captain Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A") stated that he encountered bad weather and enroute and decided to divert to Lahore. He was lost before reaching Raiwind Railway Station and started circling the said Railway Station at flight level 1000 feet AGL, without knowing his ground position.
- 21.1.5. Mr. Kirni Qamar, Duty Controller Lahore Airport stated that the aircraft could not be vectored to Lahore Airport because of the unserviceability of VDF
- 21.1.6. According to the statement of Mr. Ejaz Hussain, Assistant Electronic Engineer of Lahore Airport (Appendix "D") the VDF had been frequently unserviceable. He further stated that the manpower was not trained on this equipment and that the maintenance manual was not for this equipment. The matter had never been taken up with HQCAA.
- 21.1.7. Mr. Iftikhar Ahmed Butt (Appendix "E")
Duty ATCO Multan Airport stated that Captain Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A") and

/Safety

Safety Pilot Mr. Tariq Mehmood (Appendix "B") were briefed on all aspects of weather including Multan weather warning. He further stated that the flight plan proformas were not available because of the non availability of photo stat papers. Therefore the pilots were advised to file the flight plan on R/T for tape and record. This is supported by the statements of Mr. Aslam Qureshi, ATCO Multan Airport (Appendix "F") and Mr. Saleem Ahmed, ATC Operator (Appendix "G").

21.1.8. Airport Manager Mr. Mubarik Ali's supervision of Air Traffic Control activities was questionable and he did not take any step to overcome the problems of ATC personnel. This is considered an example of poor supervision.

21.1.9. Captain Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A") and Safety Pilot Mr. Tariq Mehmood (Appendix "B") did not take proper action and thus entered bad weather which should have been avoided. By their action the safety of the aircraft and its occupants was jeopardized.

*unsubstantiated
conclusion*

21.1.10 Station Master Raiwind Railway Station did a commendable job by appreciating the emergency. The aircraft was in and informed the control room at Lahore Railway Station who in turn inform Airport Manager Lahore, and necessary action was taken by aATC Lahore, in retrieving the aircraft. But for the alertness and presence of mind of Station Master Raiwind Railway Station, the ground position of the aircraft would never have been known/established; as the VDF was unserviceable.

22. CAUSE

22.1. The cause of incident is carelessness and indifferent attitude on the part of Captain Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A") and Safety Pilot Mr. Tariq Mehmood (Appendix "B") in handling the flight during bad weather.

*Cannot be
proved on avail-
able evidence &
can embroil
CAA later.*

/They

No supporting arguments.

They should have contacted Multan and diverted back to Multan instead of entering the weather, which became worse with the passage of time. They totally ignored the information about weather build up enroute passed by the Captain of PK-651. They violated Civil Aviation Rules, 155 (1),(2).

23. FINDINGS

- 23.1. The aircraft was properly registered.
- 23.2. The certificate of airworthiness was valid.
- 23.3. The certificate of maintenance was valid.
- 23.4. The daily inspection was carried out which was valid.
- 23.5. Flight was properly authorised.
- 23.6. Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty was holding a valid C.P.L. with valid A.F.I. rating.
- 23.7. Mr. Tariq Mehmood held a valid C.P.L.
- 23.8. There were no defects reported on this aircraft.
- 23.9. No modification was found pending.
- 23.10. Station Master Raiwind Railway Station did a commendable job in reporting the emergency and giving the present location of the aircraft, thus enabling ATC Lahore to retrieve the aircraft safely to Lahore Airport.

- 23.11. Based on the discussions at para 21 of this report it is established that Captain Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty, C.P.L. No. 936 and Safety Pilot Mr. Tariq Mehmood C.P.L. No. 1080 have violated Rule 155 (1),(2) of Civil Aviation Rule, 1978 and also violated A.I.P.(RAC 1-1, para-2, sub para 3.3.1.1.2.2.) for not filing the flight plan accordingly.

no evidence produced to support this.

Wrong finding. The pilot was told to file on R/T see App E statement of D. ATCO

- 23.12. Airport Manager Multan, Mr. Mubarik Ali, displayed poor supervision and control over ATC Controllers resulting in the flight plan not being filed in accordance with A.I.P.(RAC 1-1, para-2, sub para 3.3.1.1.2.2.), which is considered a serious lapse.

/Recommendations

24. RECOMMENDATIONS

*very loose (+
unbecoming) state -
want that can
backfire legally*

- 24.1. Strict disciplinary action should be taken against Captain Mr. Anwaar Ellahi Chishty (Appendix "A") holding C.P.L. No. 936 and Safety Pilot Mr. Tariq Mehmood (Appendix "B") C.P.L. No. 1030 for wilfully violating Civil Aviation Rules 1978 and also violating A.I.P. (RAC 1-1, para-2, sub para 3.3.1.1.2.2.) for not filing the flight plan accordingly.
- 24.2. A letter of displeasure should be given to Airport Manager Multan, Mr. Mubarik Ali for displaying poor supervision and control over ATC matters and also for being not at the place of duty at the time of the incident.
- 24.3. A warning letter should be issued to the Electronic Section Lahore Airport for poor supervision planning and bad maintenance of VDF equipment, resulting in frequent unserviceability of the equipment, and thus denying this facility to an aircraft in emergency.
- 24.4. Station Master Raiwind Railway Station should be given a letter of commendation for his alertness and timely reporting of the emergency and establishing the ground position of aircraft, thus enabling Lahore ATC to retrieve the aircraft safely. He should be further given a cash reward of Rs. 5000/- only in appreciation of his services rendered, which ultimately saved the aircraft and the life of the occupants.
- 24.5. SATO at Multan Airport is an inexperienced individual and should be replaced by an experienced officer, so that positive control is exercised over the ATC staff.

Dated: 28th October, 1985.