

CIVIL AVIATION AUTHORITY
ISLAMABAD AIRPORT

IMMEDIATE

INVESTIGATION REPORT, INTO THE INCIDENT TO LAHORE
FLYING CLUB, CESSNA 152, REGISTRATION NO. AP-BAH,
WHICH FORCED LANDED NEAR MUKERIAN 20 N.M. SOUTH
OF PATHANKOT (INDIA) ON 18TH APRIL, 1984 AT 1400 P.S.T.

1. INVESTIGATION

1-1	<u>History</u>	Not applicable
1-2	<u>Injuries</u>	Nil
1-3	<u>Damage to Aircraft</u>	None
1-4	<u>Other damage</u>	None
1-5	<u>Crew Information</u>	a. Mr. Tahir Jabbar Bhatti CPL No. 1283 - Pilot of Cessna 152 AP-BAH. b. Mr. Sheikh Khalid Rahim - Occupant trainee.
1-6	<u>Aircraft Information</u>	Cessna 152, Registration No. AP-BAH
1-7	<u>Meteorological Information</u>	Moderate calm and clear visibility.
1-8	<u>Aids to Navigation</u>	Magnetic compass and D.I.
1-9	<u>Communication</u>	V.H.F.
1-10	<u>Aerodrome and ground facilities</u>	WALTON
1-11	<u>Flight recorders</u>	Not applicable
1-12	<u>Wreckage</u>	Nose Wheel completely damaged, some dents on Tail plane (as reported).
1-13	<u>Fire</u>	Not applicable
1-14	<u>Survival aspects</u>	Not applicable
1-15	<u>Tests and research</u>	Not applicable
1-16	<u>Additional data</u>	The pilot lost his way while flying from 'Walton' to BALLOKI, CHANGA MANGA and back to WALTON; and landed in India (Mukarian 20 N.M. south of Pathankot.)

2. ANALYSIS

- 2-1 Mr. Tahir Jabbar Bhatti, C.P.L. No. 1283, Pilot in Command was authorised on a flight on 18th April, 1984 for Walton - Balloki - Changa Manga and back (See Appendix 'D' & 'T').
- 2-2 He was on this flight for renewal of his C.P.L. No. 1283 which was due to expire on 7th May, 1984. He was carrying a student Pilot Mr. Sheikh Khalid Raheem as a passenger (See Appendix 'A' & 'V').
- 2-3 The visibility and surface wind conditions was normal (See Appendix 'M' & M-1). The aircraft tookoff at 1040 L.T. from Walton airfield on 18th April, 1984. Lahore control tower was contacted who cleared the aircraft to proceed to local training area for two hours maintaining flight level 30. (See Appendix 'A').
- 2-4 The aircraft 152 AP-BAH was serviceable in all respects (See Appendix 'O', 'P', 'Q', 'R' & 'S'). According to the statement of Mr. Niamat Ullah Khan, Flight Instructor/Charter Pilot of Lahore Flying club, Mr. Tahir Jabbar Bhatti, Pilot in Command was fully briefed on the sortie i.e. Walton - Balloki - Changa Manga and back (See Appendix 'B'). He was also briefed about the local lost procedure (See Appendix 'N'). The duration of flight was 01.30 minutes.
- 2-5 According to the statement of the Pilot in Command (See Appendix 'A') he experienced no difficulty while flying from Walton to Balloki. However at Balloki he made a number of steep turns to show the student Pilot Mr. Shiekh Khalid Raheem, the location of Balloki. After this he got disorientated and could not pin point his position. He made a number of corrections but failed to establish his position. He started steering Easterly heading but it was of no use. Ultimately he decided to carry out local lost procedure and started steering Westerdy heading, and crossed a river which he thought was river Ravi actually it was river 'Sutlaj' and river 'Bias'. During this period he kept on trying to establish radio contact with Lahore but failed to do so (See

/Appendix

Appendix 'A').

- 2-6 At 1300 hrs. SATO Lahore airport was informed by the duty controller that Cessna 152 AP-BAH had relayed a message through PK-312 that he was unsure of his position. SATO immediately proceeded to control tower. Contact with Cessna 152 AP-BAH was re-established through another aircraft PK-655.
- 2-7 S.O.C. and P.A.F. radar Lahore were requested for help. The last position reported by Cessna 152 AP-BAH was at 1200 hrs. over head Changa Manga. After which contact with the aircraft was lost. The aerodrome controller asked L.F.C. to check if the aircraft had landed back at Walton which was confirmed. Later on it was found that the aircraft 152 AP-BAH was still in the air (See Appendix 'E').
- 2-8 Cessna 152 AP-BAH could not identify any ground features and hence his position could not be identified. At that time he was steering 300° and was advised to steer 270° and climb to FL 65. So that P.A.F. radar could identify him. The aircraft climbed to flight level 65 as advised by ATC Lahore. Subsequently the pilot of Cessna 152 AP-BAH reported sighting the Railway line and a canal. PK-655 assessed that Cessna 152 AP-BAH was probably over 'Kasur' area. This was supported by the fact that Lahore tower also started reading Cessna 152 AP-BAH loud and clear, but the aircraft could not hear ATC Lahore.
- 2-9 P.A.F. radar at Lahore could not identify the location of Cessna 152 AP-BAH and mistook another "blip" on the radar screen as that of Cessna 152 AP-BAH. No statement could be taken from P.A.F. without the approval of Air Headquarters.
- 2-10 From this time onward all types of instructions and numerous headings were passed to Cessna 152 AP-BAH through PK-655. The Pilot of Cessna 152 AP-BAH carried out all those instructions but failed to reach Walton airfield. (See Appendix 'E' & 'J'). The assistance given by PK-655 was indeed

/commendable

commendable in passing all the instructions transmitted to him by ATC Lahore. Apart from that these instructions were of no use as the exact position of the aircraft was not known, and it was based on guess work.

- 2-11 There were no Navigational Aids in the aircraft such as A.D.F. and V.O.R. Furthermore ATC Lahore has not been provided with any radar or V.D.F. Had these facilities been there the aircraft could have been recovered.
- 2-12 There were 50 minutes left of their endurance when he established contact with PK-655. He informed PK-655 that he was lost. The Captain of PK-655 tried to help him, but could not do so as he was unable to see them and had no means at his disposal to establish their position. After some time the pilot of Cessna 152 AP-BAH saw some hills on his right side, by now their was hardly any endurance left. He informed PK-655, who advised him to locate a field and carry out a force landing.
- 2-13 He started decending and looked around for a place to force land the aircraft. Ultimately at 400 feet above ground level at 1355 hours the engine flammed out. The Pilot in Command Mr. Tahir Jabbar Bhatti landed in a wheat field. The Pilot touched down at high speed and after covering a short distance he saw a 'Nullah' ahead. The aircraft bounced over the 'Nullah' which was approximately 3 feet wide. The aircraft came to rest. They immediately jumped out of the aircraft to save themselves in case of fire. However the aircraft did not catch fire; the nose wheel was completely broken and there were some dents on tail plane (See Appendix 'A' & 'V'). He asked people around about his location and was told that he was in INDIA. The Pilot in Command Mr. Tahir Jabbar Bhatti then went to a nearby paper mill and informed the police about the incident. (See Appendix 'A' & 'V')
- 2-14 The Police took them i.e. Mr. Tahir Jabbar Bhatti and the student pilot Mr. Sheikh Khalid Raheem to a civil rest house

at Mukerian 20 miles South of Pathankot where they had force landed. The approximate route that they followed over Indian territory is shown in Appendix 'U'. They were interrogated for two days and were treated nicely. The Indian authorities told them that since the aircraft was damaged and was not in flying condition it would take some time before it was repaired. On 20th April, 1984 they were released and brought to 'Wagha' border and handed over to the Pakistani Government. They crossed the border at 2045 L.T. They were taken by the Intelligence Unit of Pakistan, where they were interrogated. They were released on 21st April, 1984 at approximately 1700 L.T. They were brought by Lahore Flying club by two Flight Instructors, namely Mr. Niamat Ullah Khan and Mr. Anwar Karim Mirza (See Appendix 'A' & 'T'). The Pilot in Command reported to Investigating Officer Islamabad Airport on 24th April, 1984.

- 2-15 A search and rescue aircraft Cessna 185 Registration No. AP-ANG was also sent up at 1330 hrs. by Chief flying instructor Mr. M.A.K. Aziz (See Appendix 'D') alongwith Mr. Anwar Karim Mirza, Flight Instructor. An extensive search was carried out but they could not establish contact with Cessna 152 AP-BAH. However contact was made with PK-655 who was requested to inform Cessna 152 AP-BAH aircraft to steer 270°. At that time Cessna 152 AP-BAH was left with 40 minutes of endurance. Mr. Niamat Ullah Khan Flight Instructor was asked by ATC Lahore to steer 190° at FL 45 and look for AP-BAH. However the search and rescue Pilot could not locate the aircraft 152 AP-BAH. The search and rescue Pilot landed back at Walton at 1550 L.T.
- 2-16 Search Pilot again got airborne at 1630 L.T. as advised by Chief Flight Instructor and SATCO Lahore (See Appendix 'D' & 'E') alongwith Mr. Anwar Karim Mirza Flight Instructor and Chief Engineer Mr. Muhammad Sadiq Khan towards 'Pasrur' and Sialkot (See Appendix 'B' & 'D'). The search and rescue Pilot carried out a search over 'Nandipur Hydrlworks, Pasrur, Sialkot and Marala Head Works but could not locate the aircraft 152

/AP-BAH

AP-BAH. The aircraft Cessna 185 AP-ANG landed back at Walton 1800 L.T. and informed the SATCO Lahore that the aircraft Cessna 152 AP-BAH had most probably landed in Indian territory. At 1825 L.T. the search and rescue Pilot was informed by SATCO Lahore that Cessna 152 AP-BAH had forced landed at 'Mukarian' 20 miles south of 'Pathankot'. C.F.I. was informed accordingly.

- 2-17 The briefing room of Lahore Flying Club at Walton was poorly equipped. Important items like local flying area and local lost procedure were not prominently displayed. The remaining charts were faded and the hard board was moth eaten. These discrepancies were brought to the notice of C.F.I. who assured that rectification would be done. The Pilot of aircraft 152 AP-BAH had not flown for the last six months prior to this flight on 18th April, 1984.
- 2-18 Mr. Tahir Jabbar Bhatti, Pilot in Command was not given a dual check or any familiarisation trip, which is considered a serious lapse on the part of authorities concerned. Sending a student Pilot with another Pilot holding a C.P.L. licence was wrong as there was no such requirement and in fact it contributed to this incident, as the Pilot made steep turns over Balloki to show the student Pilot, otherwise there was no such requirement. Furthermore he could hardly be of any help to the Pilot in such an emergency.
- 2-19 The flight discipline at Lahore flying club left much to be desired and needed immediate attention.
- 2-20 The local training area (Appendix 'U') may be relocated well within Pakistan territory, so that in case a Pilot is lost he does not cross the border and end up in India.

3. CONCLUSION

- 3-1 The Pilot in Command Mr. Tahir Jabbar Bhatti C.P.L. No.1283 was on an authorised flight on 18th April, 1984 from Walton to Balloki - Changa Manga and back along with a student

/Pilot

Pilot Mr. Sheikh Khalid Raheem as a passenger.

- 3-2 While over Head Balloki he did some steep turns to show the student Pilot Mr. Sheikh Khalid Raheem, Balloki Head Works.
- 3-3 After finishing the steep turns he was disorientated and lost himself and force landed in India at Mukarian 20 N.M. South of Pathankot.

MAIN CAUSES

- 3-4 a. Due to poor Navigation Pilot in Command lost his way and landed in India.
- b. He carried out some steep turns to show the student Pilot Balloki Head Works which was unauthorised; when he was disorientated.
- c. He flew this mission after a lapse of six months without being given any duel/familiarisation sortie by Chief Flying Instructor, Lahore flying club.
- d. The student Pilot Mr. Sheikh Khalid Raheem should not have been on board. He caused further confusion.

CONTRIBUTORY FACTORS

- 3-5 a. There were no Navigational Aids on the aircraft such as A.D.F. and V.O.R.
- b. A.T.C. Lahore has not been equipped with radar or V.D.F.
- c. Numerous headings and Flight Levels were passed on to the Pilot of Cessna aircraft by A.T.C. through PK-655 which confused the Pilot further.
- d. P.A.F. radar mistook a 'blip' on the radar screen and thereby wrongly identified it as Cessna 152 AP-BAH. This is also considered a serious lapse on the part of person/ persons concerned.
- 3-6 Two search and rescue sorties were carried out by Mr. Niamat Ullah Khan, Flight Instructor/Charter Pilot on aircraft 185 AP-ANG for search and rescue of Cessna 152 AP-BAH but could not locate/see the aircraft.
- 3-7 A.T.C. and search/rescue aircraft had no communication with Cessna 152 AP-BAH.

/Suitable

4. RECOMMENDATIONS

4-1 Suitable disciplinary action may be taken against Mr. Tahir Jabbar Bhatti, Pilot in Command of Cessna 152 AP-BAH for poor Navigation, resulting in a force landing in India.

4-2 A dual/familiarisation check must be carried out in case a Pilot has not flown over a period of one month or more by a Q.F.I.

4-3 No Safety Pilot should be put on board the aircraft.

4-4 Periodic checks of Instructors, Pilots instrument ratings be carried out by C.A.A.

4-5 All checks for the initial issue of P.P.L., C.P.L. and ratings be carried out by CAA. Periodical checks should be carried out of all flying Instructors including C.F.I. for their professional efficiency.

4-6 Authorisation book to be page numbered and stamped by CAA.

4-7 The briefing room should be properly organised. Local lost procedure, local training area and allied procedures/information should be prominently displayed.

4-8 Working of all clubs be stream lined and a study may be carried out to pin point the weak areas, by CAA.

4-9 Navigation sorties should be planned to the points deep into Pakistan territory i.e. West of Lahore and competent Instructors should impart Navigation training.

4-10 Training area may also be shifted as far deep as possible West of Lahore.

4-11 Map and local lost procedure charts must be kept in the aircraft.

4-12 No under trainee student should be allowed to board the aircraft except with a Q.F.I.

4-13 All aircraft must be equipped with at least one A.D.F. and one V.O.R.

4-14 V.D.F. should be installed at the A.T.C. building on

/Top priority

'Top Priority' and possibility of installing a radar may also be considered.

4-15 Basic instruments such as magnetic compass, D.I. etc. must be calibrated for accuracy. Variation and Deviation cards must be upto-date and placed in the aircraft at the appropriate position.

4-16 Air Headquarters may be informed about the discrepancies noticed in handling this emergency by the P.A.F. radar controller/controllers.

to be checked on
GN & H's
vinty

5
0

5
c